



## Town of Arnprior Staff Report

**Subject:** Request for Award of REC-2024-02 (Robert Simpson Park Revitalization Design Services)

**Report Number:** 24-07-08-01

**Report Author and Position Title:** Patrick Foley, Engineering Officer;  
Graeme Ivory, Director of Recreation

**Department:** Operations & Recreation

**Meeting Date:** July 8, 2024

---

### Recommendations:

**That** Council award RFP No. REC-2024-02 Robert Simpson Park Revitalization Design Services to Stantec Consulting for a total of \$595,015.00 (plus HST); and

**Further That** Council authorize the General Manager, Operations to spend an additional contingency value of \$60,549.00.

**Further That** Council authorize the budgetary overage of \$205,457.57 to be funded 85% from Capital Expenditure Reserve Fund and 15% from Development Charges Reserve Fund.

**Further That** Council enact a bylaw authorizing the CAO to execute the agreements, and related documents with Stantec Consulting to complete the scope of work specified.

### Background:

Robert Simpson Park has long been seen as a landmark within the Town of Arnprior boasting a beautiful waterfront, sandy beach, large open green space, mature trees and ample amenities for recreation activities, major events and community/family gatherings. This park plays a vital role in a majority of the town-run and major community events during the summer months and is easily the Town's busiest outdoor space from Victoria Day through to Labour Day.

In late 2019, thinc design was contracted to complete a Waterfront Master Plan to establish general concepts for Town-owned shoreline projects. This plan was delivered to Council in November 2021 and approved through the 2022 budget process.

In the Waterfront Master Plan, seven (7) key directions were established:

- i. Improve access / increase connectivity
- ii. Enhance the visitor experience
- iii. Provide space to celebrate and enjoy
- iv. Support arts, culture and heritage
- v. Improve aesthetics of the waterfront
- vi. Provide multi-season benefit
- vii. Be ecologically driven

Robert Simpson Park is the primary park property captured within the Master Plan, with several projects in this park being a major segment of the Plan.

The Waterfront Master Plan identified thirteen (13) recommendations for Robert Simpson Park:

- RS-1: Park-wide Accessibility Improvements
- RS-2: Beach Expansion and Pier
- RS-3: Beach Level Vehicle Access and Parking
- RS-4: Pedestrian Ramp to Beach
- RS-5: Boardwalk and Landscaping
- RS-6: Gradual Timber Steps (Provisional)
- RS-7: Additional Seating and Picnic Opportunities
- RS-8: Playground and Splash Pad Enhancements
- RS-9: Change Facility
- RS-10: Small Craft Rental
- RS-11: Increase Park Capacity
- RS-12: Accessible Washrooms
- RS-13: Urban Canopy

From these recommendations, the Beach Expansion and Pier is the most significant component of this project, as the preliminary consideration from the Waterfront Master Plan suggests re-instating the breakwater, allowing the beach to return to its historic location, remain protected and move further from the confluence of the Ottawa and Madawaska Rivers, which has long been an area of concern from a public safety perspective.

In 2023, the first project from the Waterfront Master Plan was completed with pathway surface and lighting improvements made along the western shoreline of the Madawaska River with a 1.2km section of the Gillies Trail paved and lit, connecting Arnprior's historic downtown with our crown-jewel of parks – Robert Simpson Park.

Also, as part of the 2023 capital budget, the design for the redevelopment of Robert Simpson Park was approved by Council. In 2023, staff engaged Jp2g Consultants to define a scope of work with required deliverables due to the specialized nature of the project and complete a detailed topographic survey of the park for bidders of the complete design project to use.

The scope of the design assignment includes a wide variety of elements as follows:

- Shoreline modification
- Breakwater design
- Bathymetric Surveys
- Geotechnical investigations
- Establishing network of accessible pathways
- Establishing boardwalk for accessible route from the upper-level parking lot to the beach level
- Replacement and improvements to play features including the splashpad, play structure(s) and swing set(s)
- Permit applications regarding shoreline modification and working in the Ottawa River
- Indigenous consultation
- Environmental Assessments

The scope of work as defined for this phase was published as a Request for Proposal (RFP) to include the following components:

1. Defined options to achieve objectives (eg. different styles of breakwaters)
2. Concept Design with high level estimates
3. Public Consultation
4. Tender Ready Contract Documents

The Town does already have general concept designs from the Waterfront Master Plan activity though this scope of work does contain a more detailed concept design to establish specifics. An example would be exploring the feasibility of different types of breakwaters, such as a solid concrete structure, a floating system, a modular buoy system, or different possible shapes and configurations.

## **Discussion:**

The Request for Proposal (RFP) package was published to Merx.com on April 29, 2024 where it remained open to the public until June 26, 2024. RFP information was also posted on the Town's website and notices were circulated to specialized consulting firms that had completed projects in the area.

At the June 26, 2:00 PM deadline, submissions were received from the following design firms:

- Aquafor Beech Ltd.
- Janet Rosenberg & Studio Inc.
- NAK Design Strategies
- Ruhland & Associates Ltd.
- Stantec Consulting

The proposals have been reviewed by staff to ensure that they match the Town's requirements, as originally declared in the RFP package. The Town of Arnprior

evaluation team, made up of Recreation and Operations staff, evaluated each proposal based on merits within the following categories:

- 10% - Understanding of Scope of Work and Project Objectives
- 10% - Experience and Qualifications of Firm
- 15% - Experience and Qualifications of Key Personnel
- 15% - Quality of Approach and Methodology and Creativity
- 15% - Workplan, Schedule, and Level of Effort
- 10% - Overall presentation of the proposal
- 25% - Price

The financial component of the submission was only evaluated if a score of 75% or greater was achieved in the technical components – technical requirements make up 75% of the overall score. Janet Rosenberg & Studio, NAK Design Strategies and Stantec Consulting achieved a passing score on the technical components of the Proposal evaluation. The below table shows results of the evaluation:

<b>Proponent</b>	<b>Cost (incl. Net HST)</b>	<b>Overall Score</b>
Janet Rosenberg & Studio	\$ 687,805.75	80
NAK Design Strategies	\$ 555,958.11	82
Stantec Consulting	\$ 605,487.26	87

The consulting firms that were not successful in achieving 75% or more in Technical Requirements had some of the following concerns: significant omissions, schedule concerns, less applicable reference projects, inappropriate assumptions, lack of deliverables in schedule, lack of recognition of critical path tasks or poor presentation.

Stantec Consulting was evaluated to be the overall best value proposal. Stantec Consulting is a massive, multi-disciplinary firm, made up on 31,000 employees in more than 400 locations. While other proponents relied on subconsultants for significant portions of the scope of work, Stantec was able to provide the bulk of requested services with an in-house team.

### **Options:**

Council may choose not to award this contract, however the proposals received were obtained through a competitive process and are representative of current market costs.

### **Policy Considerations:**

This project was published as a Request for Proposal (RFP) in accordance with Section 6.4 (Request for Proposals) of the Town of Arnprior's Procurement Policy.

This project is in line with the Waterfront Master Plan and Objective 1.1 of the Strategic Plan key priority, Community Wellbeing & Culture, as endorsed by Council.

An RFP was chosen for this scope of work instead of the more common Request for Tender (RFT) because the scope of work relies on the qualitative information more than a tendering situation would allow. There are a lot of complexities to this relatively unique design assignment which requires multiple disciplines from multiple vendors to work together to provide a final deliverable.

### Financial Considerations:

The budget for the scope of work is \$478,000. The proposed cost for Stantec’s design proposal is \$605,487.26 (incl. net HST). It is recommended that an additional 10%, or \$60,549.00 be allocated as a contingency to address unforeseen aspects and pay costs associated with permits relating to modifying the shoreline and working in the river. This leaves an overall net budget shortfall of \$205,457.57 or 43% per the below calculations:

<b>Stantec Proposal</b>	\$ 595,015.00
<b>Net HST</b>	\$ 10,472.26
<b>10% Design Contingency</b>	\$ 60,549.00
<b>RFP Preparation &amp; Survey (Jp2g)</b>	\$ 17,421.31
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 683,457.57</b>
<b>Less: Budget Value</b>	- \$ 478,000.00
<b>Total Shortfall</b>	<b>\$ 205,457.57</b>

This project is funded 85% by the Capital Expenditure Reserve Fund (CERF) and 15% by Development Charges (DCs). The below table breaks down the overall costs of the project from a funding perspective and outlines the percentage of coverage from each funding source for the shortfall:

<b>Funding Source</b>	<b>Percentage</b>	<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>Shortfall</b>
Capital Expenditure Reserve Fund	85%	\$ 566,130.82	\$ 174,638.94
Development Charges	15%	\$ 99,905.44	\$ 30,818.63

Based on proposals received, Stantec’s proposed value appears to be within current market rates. It is noted that the budget value of \$478,000 was based on a very high-level concept presented in the 2021 Waterfront Master Plan. To further refine the complete requirements for this scope of work, Jp2g Consultants provided professional guidance on what would be required to successfully progress to the construction phase. Based on this information, the RFP package was written and the more refined scope is what consultants were bidding on.

As a placeholder, the Long Range Capital Forecast (LRCF) currently breaks out the

existing estimated construction budget of Robert Simpson Park into 4 years as follows:

- 2025 - \$ 597,500
- 2026 - \$ 597,500
- 2027 - \$ 1,195,000
- 2028 - \$ 1,195,000

Based on market value of design proposals received and the complexities of the design, it is anticipated that the existing construction budget totaling \$3,585,000 may not be sufficient to achieve the aspects presented in the Waterfront Master Plan. More accurate information will be brought to Council through the design phase of this project and ultimately Council will choose the preferred project options after being presented with the full financial impact of various factors. One example that will be explored will be styles of breakwater – be it a concrete structure, a floating platform or modular buoy style systems.

**Meeting Dates:**

N/A

**Consultation:**

N/A

**Documents:**

N/A

**Signatures**

**Reviewed by Department Head:** John Steckly

**Reviewed by General Manager, Client Services/Treasurer:** Jennifer Morawiec

**CAO Concurrence:** Robin Paquette

**Workflow Certified by Town Clerk:** Kaila Zamojski